

UNIVERSITI SAINS MALAYSIA

Peperiksaan Semester Kedua

Sidang Akademik 1997/98

Februari 1998

HEK 221 - Bacaan dan Tulisan Kritis

Masa: [3 jam]

THIS EXAMINATION PAPER CONTAINS FOUR [4] QUESTIONS IN SIX [6] PAGES.
Answer **ALL** questions.
Equal marks are allocated to all questions. .

1. Read the following texts on marriage and answer the questions below.

Text 1

Marriage has a beneficial effect on men. Compared to single men of the same age group, married men enjoy better physical and mental health. Their lives are likely to be longer and happier. In addition, they enjoy more successful careers, fill higher status occupations and consequently earn more money. Critics may argue that it is simply that more successful men tend to get married, but the evidence shows that it is marriage which brings about these beneficial effects. Hence the best guarantee of a long, happy, healthy and successful life for a man is to have a wife devoted to homemaking and the care of her husband.

Text 2

Surveys show that more wives than husbands express dissatisfaction with their marriage and consider their marriages unhappy. More wives start divorce proceedings. In addition, wives are much more likely to suffer from stress, anxiety and depression than their partners. Compared to their single peers, wives have poorer physical and mental health. It is clear that for many women, marriage cannot be considered a beneficial experience.

.../2

- a. State the main ideas in each text
 - b. What differences can you note in the structure of the two arguments?
 - c. How would you change Text 1 to give it the structure of Text 2?
 - d. How would you change Text 2 to give it the structure of Text 1?
2. Explain the different ways (at least 4 ways) in which some writers try to persuade the readers to adopt a point of view using various doubtful strategies.
 3. Using the framework offered by Kress (1985) on critical reading, evaluate the following text.

Education can promote development, but it depends on how development is defined. If it is seen as mainly economic growth, which tends to benefit upper-income groups, then schooling has contributed to it by widening the skills and raising the productivity of future workers. If development is defined as mainly improving the standard of living of the poorest 40 per cent of the population, then formal schooling has clearly not done much for them, since most of them are either illiterates or primary school drop-outs. Moreover, the data show that investment in education widens the gap between the rich and the poor in most countries. This results from mechanisms like regressive tax systems,¹ expensive secondary schooling, and free higher education, all of which benefit mainly the upper-income families. For this article I will define development as a movement toward a more humane society in both developing and developed nations. Such development requires political systems more responsive to the interests of the poor. It also requires rising real income² as well as a more equal distribution and management of wealth.

.../3

Types of education

20 Before looking at some of the issues, a description of the terms
used in this article might be useful. Formal education or schooling
describes the learning that takes place in schools and trains
students mainly for urban, modern-sector jobs. learning, however,
25 also takes place outside school, at home, on the street, and on the
job. This is learning by living or learning by doing and can be
called informal education. One of the few countries which
recognises the importance of informal education during the first
ten years of school is the People's Republic of China; it has
30 captured some of the benefits of informal learning by getting the
students into informal learning situations on the farms and in the
factories. All over the world, professional training in some
disciplines - medicine is an example - has long recognised the
importance of informal on-the-job learning.

Nonformal education is organised learning outside the normal
school university curriculum - examples include training
35 agricultural extension agents³ in short courses and teaching adults
how to read and write in the evening. Thus nonformal education
coexists with formal education, but it receives little funding and less
prestige. Upsetting the existing balance between the two is a major
source of conflict among educational interest groups.

40 Finally, there is adult education for self-reliance and participation,
which has its roots both in community development and worker
participation in management. Although Paulo Freire, Julius
Nyerere, Saul Alinsky and Adam Curle have developed the concept
recently, Mahatma Gandhi and others preceded them. Mao Tse-
45 Tung, however, gave the approach its most comprehensive
elaboration and application. This approach to education helps
groups of people learn how to study together and become aware of
the political and economic determinants of their poverty. They then
learn to organise and mobilise to improve their circumstances. This

- 50 differs from the often paternalistic community development approach of the past which relied on outside experts. These adult groups learn that with cooperation and organisation they can build road, manage water distribution, reduce neighbourhood crime, and grow more food. They learn that they can select their own people to
- 55 be sent for training as paramedics⁴ and teachers. Through cooperative saving they reduce their dependence on money lenders. And when these things happen to them, they develop a self-confidence that in turn generates further initiatives.
- 60 Julius Nyerere has emphasised that 'people can only develop themselves; they cannot be developed. Adult education is the key because it will help men and women to think for themselves, make their own decisions, and execute those decisions for themselves. The rural poor have to transform themselves from being acted upon to being actors.

Notes:

1. regressive tax systems (line 11) - systems in which low-income earners pay a higher percentage of their total income in tax than high-income earners (e.g. someone earning £1000 a year pays £50 i.e. 5 per cent in tax while someone earning £10,000 a year pays £100 i.e. 1 per cent).
2. real income (line 17) - income as measured by purchasing power; the amount of goods and services that can be bought with money earned (even if one earns more money, if prices rise even more, one's real income will fall).
3. agricultural extension agents (line 35) - people trained in new agricultural methods who travel to rural communities to teach farmers about new technology and farming practices.
4. paramedics (line 55) - people who help in the care of ill or injured people but are not doctors or nurses (e.g. ambulance drivers).

4. What is a Critique? Using the steps in writing a critique, describe how you would react to the assumptions presented in the following text.

WHY CULTURE MATTERS

35 Traditionally, institutional development projects have been based
on three key assumptions: a mechanistic and linear conception of
history¹, which assumes that every society must
go through the same stages before it can achieve development; a
40 technological approach to institutional development and
management that assumes that Western methods and techniques of
management are the only road to modernisation; and an ethno-
centric approach to culture that assumes that the basic goal of any
society is to achieve the same values characterising the so-called
'developed' countries (i.e., spirit of enterprise, profit motive,
45 material security, and self-interest) - countries not exhibiting such
values are viewed as primitive and underdeveloped.

The logical conclusion of this approach is that Africa's
development must be stimulated from the outside, requiring a
transfer of culture, methods, and techniques from the industrialised
Western countries. But the evidence to date strongly suggests
50 that none of these assumptions are valid.

First, the remarkable vibrancy of the informal sector² in Africa
in the midst of generalised economic crises and difficulties of most
modern sector enterprises illustrates the limits of the linear
conception. Against the background of a hostile environment and
55 lack of government support, the success of most of these micro-
enterprises is best explained by their ability to reconcile African
social and cultural values and traditions with the need for economic
efficiency. Their management is largely a family affair, relying
heavily on informal business relationships.

Notes:

1. a mechanistic and linear conception of history (lines 35-36) - an understanding of history as a coherent 'line' of development (as opposed to a repeated cycle) which can be measured in terms of technological and scientific progress.
2. informal sector (line 51) - the part of a country's private economy which is loosely or informally organised and difficult to register centrally or regulate.

60 Second, the lack of success of most traditional approaches to
institutional and public sector development in Africa clearly shows
the limitations of the technological approach. In fact, it is now
generally accepted that simply transferring some kind of know-how
(e.g., new teaching methods, new techniques of personnel
65 administration, and new budget devices) to Africa will not suffice.
There must also be a high degree of national identification with the
programs and projects - what is now referred to as 'internalisation'
or 'ownership'. For this to be optimal, commitments will have to be
forthcoming, not just from the political leadership but from the civil
70 servants and general population as well.

Third, extensive studies and research, along with observations by
the author, seem to suggest that Western values are not always
congruent with traditional incentives and behavioural patterns
prevalent in most African countries. Self-reliance and self-interest
75 tend to take a back seat to ethnicity and group loyalty - there are
still thousands of ethnic groups on the continent. The main
concern seems to be maintaining social balance and equity within
the groups, rather than individual economic achievements.
Generally, the interest of the local and ethnic communities takes
80 precedence over whatever the government may declare as national
goals. Clearly, the six to eight decades of colonisation were simply
not long enough for both individuals and governments to develop a
new national entity that could transcend ethnicity and the traditional
decision-making system.

85 Thus, the need to understand - and take into account -
idiosyncrasies of African political and sociocultural structure is of
paramount importance if the development community is to help
African reform and increase the efficiency of its public and private
sectors in a sustainable manner. It is the combination of both the
90 sociocultural and technical-managerial elements of institutional
development that will determine the quality and success of efforts
in this area.

- oooOOOooo -