

**EVALUATING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF A CONCEPTUAL SKILL
TRAINING: A QUASI-EXPERIMENTAL APPROACH**

by

LEE KAR LING

**Thesis submitted in fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree
of Doctor of Philosophy**

NOVEMBER 2007

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This acknowledgement is written with mixed feelings as the journey from start till the culmination of the thesis has not been easy. Firstly, it has been exciting and stimulating for me as I strive to enhance my knowledge and hope that in the process, contribute to a broader reader base to share the knowledge gained. However, despite the uneven and often arduous journey, I had been fortunate to have met with excellent supervisors, friends, peers and family who had steadfastly stood by me and had contributed in one way or another to help make the arduous trek more enjoyable, fruitful and to be filled with pride at the ultimate achievement.

I will firstly like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor, Associate Professor Dr. Zainal Ariffin Ahmad and my co-supervisor, Professor Mahfooz Ansari who had stood by me so patiently despite my sluggish progress and had displayed compassion and understanding for the hardships that I had endured throughout my research journey. Their continuous support, guidance, and challenges had made the research process more challenging, exciting, and stimulating. Though I was stressed out mentally at times, it was through no fault of theirs! There were times when I had become so de-motivated and was about to concede and give up, but both my excellent supervisors would untiringly continue to prod and egg me on to strive for betterment. For that, I sincerely thank them.

I wish also to extend my thanks for Professor Muhammad Jantan (M.J.), Associate Professor T. Ramayah, Associate Professor Dr. Azzat Nasuridin, Associate Professor Dr. Intan Osman, Associate Professor Dr. Yusserie Zainuddin, Puan Adida Yang Amri and Mr. Quah Chun Hoo for their enlightening, enticing, constructive feedback and suggestions that had helped me to enhance and improve on the research. A note of appreciation to Dr. Lilis who had assisted me during my data collection despite her busy schedule. My sincere appreciation is also extended to the

Dean of the School of Management, Professor Dato' Daing Nasir Ibrahim for his invaluable support and continuous encouragement throughout my tenure as a PhD candidate. Special thanks to Associate Professor Datin Dr. Ruhani Ali, Acting Deputy Dean who had provided me with much needed assistance when the need arise, without which this endeavor would not have borne fruit. Thanks too to all the staff of the School of Management, specifically, Puan Rusnah, Puan Aton, and Ms. Kim who had rendered their invaluable time and effort to assist me in whatever way possible.

A special notation and thanks to the USM School of Management for the use of the OB Lab throughout my data collection, without which this thesis would not have been possible.

My gratitude however goes beyond the School of Management. I would like to extend my heartfelt thanks to Associate Professor Azhari Karim from the International Diplomatic Study department who is both a friend and mentor, who had urged me on when my personal life threatened to over-rule my research process. Thanks too to Mr. Jim Kirkpatrick, the son of Mr. Donald Kirkpatrick (whose model I had used in the research) who had given me the direction needed to proceed; and to numerous others who had shared their knowledge, experiences and provided invaluable inputs to assist in making this an accomplishment to be proud of.

My heartfelt thanks and appreciation to Ong Joo Lee, my friend and colleague and my mum who had borne most of my complaints, lamentations and incessant groaning with extreme patients and fore bearings, while tirelessly standing by me and taking my stressful load from me when the need arise. Without them, I would probably have collapsed from stress, exhaustion and mental distraught.

To my two lovely daughters, whom I had borne during my candidature; my apologies for neglecting both of you and for the sacrifices that the two of you had to ensure for my sake, it is thus written here for both of you to read in the future. Last, but not least, my sincere thanks to all those lovely people who had contributed generously to the success of this research in one way or another. Thanks a million!

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	x
LIST OF APPENDICES	xi
ABSTRAK	xii
ABSTRACT	xiv

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.0	Introduction	1
1.1	Importance of Training Effectiveness	2
1.2	Training Effectiveness and Transfer of Training	3
1.3	Factors Affecting Training Effectiveness	4
1.4	Problem Statement	7
1.5	Objectives of the Study	9
1.6	Research Questions	9
1.7	Scope of the Study	10
1.8	Significance of the Study	13
1.9	Definitions of Key Terms	14
1.10	Organization of the Chapters	19

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.0	Introduction	20
2.1	Training and Development	20
2.2	Malaysia's Scenario on Training and Development	25
2.3	Assessing Training Effectiveness	26
2.4	Training Evaluation Tools	30
2.5	Training Evaluation and Training Effectiveness	40
2.6	Factors Affecting Training Effectiveness	45
2.6.1	Perceived Superior Support on Training Effectiveness	49
2.6.2	Participants' Individual Characteristics	56

2.6.3	Participants' Learning Styles	60
2.6.4	Participants' Perception Towards Training	65
2.6.5	Participants' Self-Efficacy	68
2.7	Conceptual Skills Training	70
2.8	Experimental Design and Training Effectiveness	76
2.9	Longitudinal Assessment of Training Effectiveness	80
2.10	Gaps in the Literature	81
2.11	The Theoretical Framework	84
2.11.1	The Variables	79
2.12	Underlying Theories	93
2.13	Hypotheses	99
2.14	Threats to Internal Validity	112
2.15	Summary	113

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

3.0	Introduction	114
3.1	General Research Approach	115
3.2	Solomon's 4-Group Design	117
3.3	Multiple N, Single I, Time Series Design	120
3.4	Problems Associated with the Research Design	124
3.5	Participants	128
3.6	Experimental Design and Procedures	130
3.6.1	Assignment of Participants	131
3.6.2	Collection of Demographic Information	134
3.6.3	Collection of Pre-training Measures	136
3.6.4	Experimental Manipulation	139
3.6.5	Collection of Post-training Measures	144
3.6.5.1	Experimental Group	144
3.6.5.2	Placebo Group	149
3.6.5.3	Control Group One	152
3.6.5.4	Control Group Three	153
3.7	Experimental Control	154
3.7.1	Control for Training Material	155
3.7.2	Control for Trainer	157
3.7.3	Control for Training Environment	159

3.8	Measures	162
3.8.1	Preliminary Tests	162
3.8.1.1	Descriptive Data	163
3.8.1.2	Test of Homogeneity – Demographic Variables	164
3.8.1.3	Test of Homogeneity – Pre-tests	167
3.8.1.4	Learning Styles	171
3.8.1.5	Perceived Superior Support	174
3.8.1.6	Task Oriented Self-Efficacy	175
3.8.2	Data Analysis	177
3.8.2.1	Pre-post Tests	177
3.8.2.2	Factors Affecting Training Effectiveness	184
3.8.2.3	Comparative Analysis	188

CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS

4.0	Introduction	195
4.1	Preliminary Analysis	195
4.1.1	Participants' Industrial Background	195
4.1.2	Test of Homogeneity	198
4.1.2.1	Test of Homogeneity – Demographic Variables	199
4.1.2.2	Test of Homogeneity – Pre-test	211
4.1.3	Reliability	218
4.1.3.1	Perceived Superior Support	218
4.1.3.2	Task Oriented Self-Efficacy	220
4.1.3.3	Learning Styles	222
4.1.4	Correlation of Dependent Variables	225
4.2	Hypotheses Testing	228
4.2.1	Experimental Group	228
4.2.1.1	Hypothesis 1	229
4.2.1.2	Hypothesis 2	237
4.2.1.3	Hypothesis 3	245
4.2.2	Comparative Analysis	248
4.2.2.1	Hypothesis 4	248
4.2.2.2	Hypothesis 5	251
4.2.2.3	Hypothesis 6	254
4.3	Summary of Results	263

CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

5.0	Introduction	266
5.1	Implications of Preliminary Analyses	266
5.1.1	Participants' Industrial Background	266
5.1.2	Tests of Homogeneity	267
5.1.3	Reliability Analyses	271
5.1.4	Correlation of Dependent Variables	273
5.2	Results	274
5.2.1	Hypothesis 1	274
5.2.2	Hypothesis 2	277
5.2.3	Hypothesis 3	281
5.2.4	Hypothesis 4	283
5.2.5	Hypothesis 5	287
5.2.6	Hypothesis 6	289
5.3	Implications of the Study	293
5.3.1	General Implications	294
5.3.2	Practical Implications	308
5.4	Limitations of the Research	314
5.5	Directions for Future Researches	321
5.6	Conclusion	327

REFERENCES	330
-------------------	-----

APPENDICES	360
-------------------	-----

Appendix I [Experimental Procedure Documents]	I
Appendix II [Results]	II
Appendix III [Administrative Documents]	III

LIST OF TABLES

	Page
2.1 Kirkpatrick's 4-Levels of Training Evaluation	33
2.2 Summary of Evaluation Instruments	34
2.3 Broad Categories of Factors Influencing Training Effectiveness	47
2.4 Relevant Skills for Effective Management	73
2.5 Solomon 4-group Experimental Design	88
2.6 The modified Solomon 4-group Experimental Design used in the study	88
2.7 Operational Framework for the Quasi-experimental design	98
3.1 Multiple N, Single I, Time Series Design with Solomon 4-Group	122
3.2 Types of Preliminary Tests conducted in the study	163
4.1 Participants' Industrial Background	196
4.2 Extent of Mortality of Groups within the Experiment	200
4.3 Extent of Correlation between Covariate Variables	203
4.4 Detailed Analysis of the Between-subject Effects of all the groups	204
4.5 Profile of Participants	207
4.6 One-Way ANOVA for Determining Extent of Homogeneity between Participants in all Groups	208
4.7 Correlation between Pre-test Learning and Pre-test Application Assessments	213
4.8 Pre-tests Mean Scores of participants in all Groups	214
4.9 Correlation Between Post-Test Learning and Post-Test Application Assessment	227
4.10 Operational Framework for the Quasi-experimental design	231
4.11 Paired Sample T-Test	237
4.12 Results of Effect of Learning Styles, age, gender, education background, and years of managerial experience on post-test scores	244
4.13 Comparisons of Mean Between Experimental Group and Control Groups	255

4.14	Post-hoc Tests: Bonferroni and Scheffe (Post-test Learning)	261
4.15	Post-hoc Tests: Bonferroni and Scheffe (Post-test Application)	261
4.16	Post-hoc Tests: Dunnett's T3 test for Post-test Learning and Post-test Application	262
4.17	Summary of Results for Hypotheses Testing	263

LIST OF FIGURES

	Page
2.1 Kolb's Learning Inventory	63
3.1 Flow Diagram of Procedures for the Quasi-experimental design	131

LIST OF APPENDICES

	Page
A Briefing Cue Sheet	IA
B Pre-post Learning Test Question	IB
B(i) Pre-post Learning Test Answer	IB(i)
C Pre-post Application Test Scenario	IC
C(i) Pre-post Application Test Answer	IC(i)
D Happy Sheet – End of Training Level 1 Evaluation	ID
E Problem Solving and Decision Making training Materials	IE
F Communication Skills Training Materials	IF
G Learning Inventory Questions	IG
G(i) Sample of Tabulated Learning Inventory	IG(i)
H Perceived Superior Support Items	IH
I Self-Efficacy Items	II
J Preliminary tests	IIJ
K Reliability and Factor Analysis Outputs	IIK
L Hypotheses Testing Outputs	IIL
M Post-hoc Tests Outputs	IIM
N Letter of Confirmation of Candidature	IIIN
O Letter to Request for Volunteers	IIIO

**Menilai Keberkesanan Latihan Kemahiran Konseptual:
Satu Pendekatan Kuasi-Eksperimental**

ABSTRAK

Latihan dan pembangunan dianggap sebagai pelaburan yang mahal bagi sesebuah syarikat dan sering diabaikan pada masa kemelesetan ekonomi. Salah satu daripada alasan-alasan untuk tidak menitikberatkan latihan dan perkembangan modal insan ialah sebab nilai dan sumbangan latihan dan perkembangan tidak dapat ditetapkan dengan berkesan. Walaupun banyak jenis alat pengukuran digunakan untuk menilai latihan, cara-cara yang digunakan masa kini tidak dapat memberi jawapan yang memadai untuk semua jenis latihan, lebih-lebih lagi untuk program perkembangan pengurusan. Walaupun penyelesaian masalah dan kemahiran membuat keputusan (kemahiran konseptual) merupakan salah satu kecekapan utama untuk pihak pengurusan, di Malaysia, tidak terdapat sebarang penyelidikan yang dapat memberi alat pengukuran yang memadai untuk menilai keberkesanan jenis latihan tersebut. Penyelidikan ini menggunakan rekabentuk kuasi-eksperimen 4-kumpulan Solomon yang diubahsuai sebagai alat penilaian asas untuk menilai tahap keberkesanan sesuatu program latihan kemahiran konseptual. Peserta-peserta untuk kuasi-eksperimen tersebut diambil daripada sektor swasta dan termasuk pihak pengurusan pertengahan dan atasan daripada industri pengilangan serta industri perkhidmatan. Penyelidikan tersebut merupakan penyelidikan 'longitudinal' sebab mengambil masa selama tiga bulan.

Keputusan yang diperolehi memberi gambaran bahawa kumpulan yang dilatih dalam kemahiran konseptual tertentu telah menunjukkan kemajuan yang mendadak dalam penyerapan pengetahuan serta didapati bahawa apa yang

telah dipelajari boleh diaplikasikan dalam tempat kerja. Keputusan yang diperolehi daripada penyelidikan tersebut menyokong hujah-hujah bahawa pemberian latihan kemahiran konseptual tertentu boleh mengakibatkan keberkesanan dalam latihan, walaupun setelah sesuatu masa telah berlalu. Keputusan yang didapati penting daripada segi teori kerana dapat memberi pandangan berkenaan dengan cara-cara menilai keberkesanan kemahiran konseptual tertentu yang sejauh ini tidak diselidiki oleh penyelidik-penyelidik yang lain di Malaysia. Untuk organisasi, keputusan daripada penyelidikan ini memberi satu alat pengukuran yang dapat menolong syarikat untuk menilai program perkembangan pengurusan yang bernilai tinggi dari segi kewangan. Ini adalah sebab rekabentuk kuasi-eksperimen lebih berkesan untuk menunjukkan bahawa sebarang perubahan dalam pengetahuan, kemahiran dan sikap adalah akibat daripada sesuatu latihan, and justeru itu, memberi bukti kepada organisasi bahawa latihan dan perkembangan memang bernilai.

Evaluating the Effectiveness of A Conceptual Skill Training: A Quasi-Experimental Approach

ABSTRACT

Training and development are viewed as expensive investments for a business organization and is often neglected during recession. One of the frequently cited reasons for not focusing on training and development was because the value and contribution could not be effectively ascertained. Although training evaluation tools and instruments abound, existing methodologies do not provide adequate answers for all types of training, more so for management development programs. Even though problem solving and decision-making skill (conceptual skill) is considered to be a key area of managerial competence, there has not been any literature in Malaysia to provide an adequate tool for assessing the effectiveness of such a program. A quasi-experimental design using Solomon's 4-group experimental design as the basic research instrument was developed to assess the extent of effectiveness of a conceptual skill training program. The participants for the quasi-experiment were drawn from the private sector, encompassing middle and senior level managers from both the manufacturing and service industries. The study was longitudinal as it was conducted over a period of three months.

The results indicated that the group that had undergone the specific conceptual skill training had shown marked improvement in terms of acquisition of knowledge and had also implied that what was learnt was able to be applied at work. The findings of the study supported the contention that training intervention in a specific conceptual skill will lead to training effectiveness, even after a period of time. The findings are of importance theoretically as it provided