

**POLITICS OF WOMEN EMPOWERMENT:
A CASE STUDY OF BENAZIR BHUTTO
SHAHEED YOUTH DEVELOPMENT
PROGRAM (BBSYDP) IN SINDH,
PAKISTAN**

by

ERUM SHAH

**Thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy**

June 2018

DEDICATION

I want to dedicate this achievement to those who trust me and nurtured
my dream of pursuing higher education.

With Love and Respect

To My Mother Zubeda Bibi & Father Syed Anwer Ali shah

To My Maternal Grand Parents

Malook Zaadi D/o Mir Makan Shah & Suleman Shah S/o Mehboob Shah

To My Paternal Grand Parents

Fateh Khatoon D/o Mir Makan Shah

&

Pir Budhal Shah S/o Mehboob Shah

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

“All the praises and gratitude go to almighty Allah; by whose honor and majesty, deeds of virtue are accomplished”.

I wish to thank everyone who has contributed to my work with this thesis. I would especially like to express my gratitude to my main supervisor Dr. Nikku Bala Raju for his inputs and comments on my research and encouragement throughout my research journey. I am equally acknowledging my Co-supervisor and Dean School of Social Sciences, Professor Dr. Azlinda Azman being the source of motivation and inspiration during my study by providing me kind suggestions.

I am also thankful to the selection committee for Summer School “Memory Making in Southeast Asia and Europe” at Humboldt University Berlin, Dr. Lye Tuck Po and Dr. Soon Chuan Yean from USM and Professor Vincent Houben and Aleah Connley from Humboldt University Berlin for the opportunity to study on semester exchange. I am highly indebted to Dean School of Social Sciences for her kind recommendation for the Summer School. I am equally thankful to all other faculty and staff of school of social sciences for the support.

I would also like to recognize Institute of Postgraduate Studies (IPS) Universiti Sains Malaysia for providing me financial assistance and allow me to work as graduate assistant in my third year of studies.

My special thanks to all key informant interviewees and focus group participants for their contribution and cooperation in the process of

data collection. I truly appreciate the support given by everyone during research process.

I wish to express my love and gratitude to my beloved parents, my siblings, my aunties and my nephew Alamdar (Ahmed Mustafa) and niece Kulsoom for their love and care throughout the duration of my study.

No words to express my love and admiration for my companion Sultan Ali. Intensive travel for data collection in Pakistan was not easy without his logistic and emotional support. His encouragement and expectations were source of strength for me whenever I felt weak in this journey.

I am also grateful to my mentors Abbas Ali Shah, Jamshed Baloch, Dr. Aijaz Ali Wassan and Noor Muhammad Bajeer for their moral support and kind attribution in my academic and professional career.

Finally, I am obliged to my friends Shabana Tunio, Faisal Haider, Fasiha Faisal, Athirah Azhar, Zain Rafiq, Dr. Muhammad Jaffar, Dr. Madiha Riaz, mentors and members of Postgraduate Student Association (PSA) for all their precious and memorable moments in USM which are unforgettable.

I would always be indebted to all the people who have played a slight role in the journey of my doctoral degree.

Erum Shah

June 2018

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	ii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES	xii
LIST OF FIGURES	xiv
LIST OF APPENDICES	xv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xvi
ABSTRAK	xix
ABSTRACT	xxi
CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION	
1.0 Overview	1
1.1 Background of the Study	1
1.2 Problem Statement	5
1.3 Research Question	10
1.4 Research Objectives	11
1.5 Scope of the Study	11
1.6 Significance of this Study Research to Social Work	12
1.7 Organization of the Study	15
CHAPTER 2 - LITERATURE REVIEW	16
2.0 Overview	16
2.1 Etymology of Empowerment	17
2.2 Historical Overview of Women Empowerment	19
2.2.1 Fifteenth to Nineteenth (1500-1900) Century	20

2.2.1(a)	The City of Ladies 1429	20
2.2.1(b)	Declaration of Women’s Rights 1791	21
2.2.1(c)	Vindication of the Rights of Women 1792	21
2.2.1(d)	Seneca Falls Convention 1848	22
2.2.1(e)	Women Suffrage 1865	22
2.2.1(f)	The Subjugation of Women 1869	23
2.2.2	Twentieth (20th) Century and Beyond	24
2.2.2(a)	Foundation of United Nations 1946	24
2.2.2(b)	United Nation Commission on the Status of Women 1946	24
2.2.2(c)	Women’s Year 1975	24
2.2.2(d)	Decades for Women Equality, Development and Peace 1976-1985	25
2.2.2(e)	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) -1979	26
2.2.2(f)	Beijing Platform for Action (BPFA) - 1995	27
2.2.2(g)	The Beijing Platform Reviews and Commitments	27
2.2.2(h)	Millennium Development Goals 2001	28
2.2.2 (i)	Sustainable Development Goals (SDGS) 2015	29
2.3	Women in Indian Subcontinent	30
2.3.1	Muslim Women in Indian Subcontinent	32
2.3.2	Post-Independence India	33
2.4	Conceptualizing Women Empowerment in Pakistan	35

2.4.1	Institutional Mechanisms	36
2.4.2	Legal Reforms for Empowerment of Women in Pakistan	36
2.4.3	Status Against Empowerment Indicators	38
2.4.3(a)	Political Participation	38
2.4.3(b)	Social and Psychological Empowerment	39
2.4.3(c)	Education	40
2.4.3(d)	Economic Empowerment	40
2.5	Linking Theoretical Framework and Women Empowerment Policies in Pakistan	41
2.5.1	Public Policy	41
2.5.2	Theoretical Framework	44
2.5.2(a)	Multiple Streams	44
2.5.2(b)	Resource Agency and Achievements	53
2.6	Conceptualization of Theoretical Framework	55
2.7	Conclusion	56
CHAPTER 3 - METHODOLOGY		59
3.0	Introduction	59
3.1	Research Approach	60
3.2	Research Design	60
3.3	Location of the Study	60
3.4	Sample of the Study	61
3.4.1	Sampling Methodology	62
3.4.1(a)	Sampling for Key Informant Interviews (KII)	63

3.4.1(b)	Sampling for Focus Group Discussions (FGDs)	64
3.5	Data Collection	66
3.5.1	Document Review	66
3.5.2	In-depth Interviews	67
3.5.3	Focus Group Discussions (FGD)	72
3.6	Data Analysis	75
3.7	Generalizability, Validity and Reliability	78
3.8	Ethical Considerations	79
3.9	Conclusion	81
CHAPTER 4 - ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS		82
4.0	Overview	82
4.1	Profiling of Research Participants	83
4.4.1	Key informants Interview Participant	83
4.1.1(a)	Political Representatives (POL)	83
4.1.1(b)	Bureaucrats (BR)	84
4.1.1(c)	Women Development Department (WDD)	84
4.1.1(d)	Civil Society (CS)	84
4.1.2	Focus Group Discussions (FGDs)	85
4.1.2(a)	Beneficiary Participant (BP) Group	86
4.1.2(b)	Non-Beneficiary Participants (NBP) Group	88
4.2	Investing Policy Process	90
4.2.1	Problem Stream	91
4.2.1(a)	Education	92

4.2.1(b)	Job Opportunities	93
4.2.1(c)	Violence Against Women	94
4.2.1(d)	Land Reforms	95
4.2.1(e)	Victim Centered Restorative Justice	96
4.2.1(f)	Maternal Mortality and Nutrition	96
4.2.2	Policy Stream	97
4.2.1(a)	History of Policy Making in Pakistan	97
4.2.1(b)	Institutional Arrangements for Women Empowerment	98
4.2.1(c)	Laws & Policies for women Empowerment	103
4.2.1(d)	Programs & Projects for Women in WDD Sindh	105
4.2.3	Political Stream	107
4.2.3(a)	Political Parties	108
4.2.3(b)	Political Representatives / Women Representative	110
4.2.3(c)	Changes in Government	111
4.2.3(d)	Pressure and Protest	112
4.2.4	Window of Opportunity	113
4.2.4(a)	Local Government 2001	114
4.2.4(b)	Election 2008	115
4.2.5	Policy Entrepreneurs	117
4.2.6	Summary of Interview Findings	120
4.3	Focus Group Discussion: BBSYDP & Women Empowerment	124
4.3.1	Resources	125

4.3.1(a)	Social Resources	125
4.3.2(b)	Institutional Resources	126
4.3.2	Agency	133
4.3.2(a)	Meaning of Empowerment	133
4.3.2(b)	Situation of Women in Sindh	134
4.3.2(c)	Role of Women Development Department and Women Parliamentarian	136
4.3.2(d)	Areas for Improvement	137
4.3.3	Achievements	140
4.3.3(a)	Self-esteem	140
4.3.3(b)	Mobility & Networking	141
4.3.3(c)	Economic Contribution	142
4.3.3(d)	Skilled Human Resource/Trust on government institution	142
4.3.4	Summary of FGD Findings	143
4.4	Conclusion	146
CHAPTER 5 - DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION		148
5.0	Overview	148
5.1	Challenges of Policy Process	149
5.1.1	Problem Stream	149
5.1.1(a)	Education	149
5.1.1(b)	Job Opportunities	150
5.1.1(c)	Violence Against Women	151
5.1.1(d)	Land Reforms	153

5.1.1(e)	Victim Centered Restorative Justice	154
5.1.1(f)	Maternal Mortality and Nutrition	154
5.1.2	Policy Stream	155
5.1.2(a)	History of Policy Making in Pakistan	156
5.1.2(b)	Institutional Arrangements for Women Empowerment	157
5.1.2(c)	Laws & Policies for women Empowerment	162
5.1.2(d)	Programs & Projects For Women In WDD Sindh	166
5.1.3	Political Stream	167
5.1.3(a)	Political Parties	167
5.1.3(b)	Women Political Representation	170
5.1.3(c)	Changes in Government	172
5.1.3(d)	Pressures and Protest	173
5.1.4	Window Of Opportunity	174
5.1.4(a)	Local Government 2001	174
5.1.4(b)	Election 2008	176
5.1.5	Policy Entrepreneur	177
5.1.6	Summary	177
5.2	Linkages between Policy Process and Women Empowerment	178
5.2.1	Resources	179
5.2.1(a)	Social Resources	179
5.2.1(b)	Institutional Resources	181
5.2.2	Agency	189
5.2.2(a)	Empowerment	190

5.2.2(b)	General Situation of Women in Sindh	191
5.2.2(c)	Role of Women Development Department (WDD) and Women Parliamentarian	193
5.2.2(d)	Areas to Improve	195
5.2.3	Achievements	196
5.2.3(a)	Social Empowerment	197
5.2.3(b)	Educational Empowerment	197
5.2.3(c)	Economic Empowerment	198
5.2.3(d)	Psychological Empowerment	198
5.2.4	Summary	199
5.3	Implication of the Study	201
5.4	Recommendation of the study	204
5.5	Limitation of the study	207
5.6	Conclusion	211
	REFERENCES	216
	APPENDICES	

LIST OF TABLES

	Page	
Table 2.1	World Summit and Conferences in 1990s	29
Table 2.2	Policy Theories	43
Table 2.3	Classification of Social Problems	46
Table 3.1	Geographical Zones in Sindh	61
Table 3.2	Sampling Methodology for Data Collection	66
Table 3.3	Interviews Data Collection Details	71
Table 3.4	FGD Data Collection Details	74
Table 3.5	Process of Data Analysis	78
Table 4.1	Key Informant Profile	83
Table 4.2	Interview Schedule	85
Table 4.3	FGDs Beneficiaries Profile	87
Table 4.4	Non-Beneficiaries FGD Participant	89
Table 4.5	FGDs Schedule	90
Table 4.6	Summary of Interview Findings	123
Table 4.7	Summary of FGD Findings	145
Table 5.1	Laws to protect women in 13 Assembly	165

Table 5.2	Projects by WDD	166
Table 5.3	BBSYDP Status	167
Table 5.4	Political Tenures 1993-2013	168
Table 5.5	Types of Resources	179
Table 5.6	Social Support	180
Table 5.7	Issues and Impact of Institutional Resources	189

LIST OF FIGURES

	Page
Figure 2.1 Kingdon's Multiple Stream	45
Figure 2.2 Kabeer's Empowerment Theory	53
Figure 2.3 Theoretical Framework	56
Figure 3.1 Sample of the Study	62
Figure 5.1 Policy Stream	155
Figure 5.2 Institutional Arrangement	157
Figure 5.3 Selection process	185
Figure 5.4 Meaning of Empowerment	190
Figure 5.5 Problems of Women in Sindh	193
Figure 5.6 Policy process Model	201

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A Consent form and Questions Guidelines for Interviews

Appendix B Consent form and Questions Guidelines for FGDs

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AASHA	Alliance Against Sexual Harassment
BBSYDP	Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Program
BISP	Benazir Income Support Program
BPFA	Beijing Platform For Action
CEDAW	Convention On The Elimination Of All Forms Of Discrimination Against Women
CSW	Commission On Status Of Women
EFA	Education For All
EU	European Union
FWBL	First Women Bank Limited
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GDI	Gender Development Index
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GEM	Gender Empowerment Measurement
GoP	Government Of Pakistan
GoS	Government Of Sindh
GRAP	Gender Reform Action Program
GSP	General Scheme Of Preferences
HDI	Human Development Index

HRCP	Human Rights Commission Pakistan
IMF	International Monitoring Fund
INGO	International Non-government organization
KII	Key Informant Interview
KPK	Khyber Pakhtunkhawa
KU	Karachi University
LHW	Lady Health Workers Program
MDGS	Millennium development Goals
MoHR	Ministry of Human Rights
MoL&J	Ministry of Law and Justice
MoLJHR	Ministry of Law Justice and Human Rights
MoWD	Ministry of Women Development
MS	Multiple Stream
NISP	National Income Support Program
NPA	National Plan of Action
NPDEW	National Policy for The Development and Empowerment of Women
NCSW	National Commission on Status of Women
NGOs	Non-Government Organizations
NWPC	National Women Parliamentarian Caucus

PCSW	Provincial Commission on Status of Women
PML(N)	Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz)
PPPP	Pakistan People’s Party Parliamentarian
PTI	Pakistan Tahreek.e. Insaaf
PWPC	Provincial Women Parliamentarian Caucus
QAU	Quaid.e. Azam University
RAA	Resources, Agency and Achievements
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SHRC	Sindh Human Rights Commission
TEVETA	Technical Education & Vocational Training Authority
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UoS	University of Sindh
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WAF	Women Action Forum
WDD	Women Development Department
WDIs	Women Development Institutes
WPC	Women Parliamentarian Caucus

**POLITIK PEMERKASAAN WANITA:
KAJIAN KES PROGRAM PEMBANGUNAN BELIA BENAZIR
BHUTTO SHAHEED DI SINDH, PAKISTAN**

ABSTRAK

Pemeriksaan wanita telah menjadi salah satu objektif utama kerajaan bagi negara-negara di Asia, begitu juga dengan Pakistan. Kajian kes ini mengkaji hubungan antara polisi memperkasakan wanita dan pelaksanaan polisi tersebut melalui *Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Program* (BBSYDP) di Sindh. Bagi memenuhi tuntutan global dalam pembangunan dan pemeriksaan wanita, dalam tujuh abad yang lalu, kerajaan Pakistan telah mengambil beberapa langkah dalam polisi untuk pemeriksaan wanita. Walaupun begitu, usaha kerajaan untuk meningkatkan status sosioekonomi dan politik wanita di Pakistan tidak menunjukkan sebarang hasil secara nyata disebabkan ia dijangka bertentangan dengan polisi yang sedia ada. Oleh itu, Kajian ini mengkaji secara lebih terperinci mengenai hubungan antara polisi kerajaan dan proses pemeriksaan wanita. Kajian ini telah dijalankan dengan mengaplikasikan *Multiple Stream Policy Process Theory* oleh John Kingdon dan *Empowerment Theory* oleh Naila Kabeer. Kajian lapangan telah dijalankan di daerah Sindh, Pakistan pada tahun 2015 dengan menggunakan kaedah kualitatif. Kajian ini menggunakan data primer dan data sekunder. Data primer berdasarkan kepada 14 responden yang terdiri daripada ahli kerajaan dan ahli bukan kerajaan. Sebagai tambahan, empat (4) kumpulan perbincangan fokus (FGDs) telah dijalankan bersama

pewaris and bukan pewaris BBSYDP. Data sekunder diperolehi menerusi pengajian semula pemerksaan wanita provinsi dan dokumen pelan tindakan pembaharuan. Kajian ini telah adalah salah satu usaha untuk mengisi jurang penyelidikan dalam pemerksaan wanita dan peranan polisi dalam kajian sosial di Pakistan. Hasil kajian mendapati bahawa sedikit sebanyak BBSYDP telah membantu dalam meningkatkan memperkasakan wanita. Walaupun begitu, terdapat beberapa faktor yang perlu diberi perhatian dalam membentuk polisi yang bertujuan untuk memperkasakan wanita seperti pendidikan wanita, kawalan patriarki dan mobiliti. Hasil kajian juga mendapati bahawa pemerksaan sosial adalah indikator yang paling penting bagi memperkasakan wanita. Kajian ini mencadangkan agar BBSYDP perlu diperkuatkan lagi dan dilaksanakan di daerah lain di Pakistan.

**POLITICS OF WOMEN EMPOWERMENT:
A CASE STUDY OF BENAZIR BHUTTO SHAHEED
YOUTH DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM (BBSYDP) IN SINDH,
PAKISTAN**

ABSTRACT

Women empowerment has been one of the core policy objectives of Asian governments and Pakistan is not an isolated case. This research study investigated the link between the women empowerment policies and their implementation on the ground taking Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Program (BBSYDP) of Sindh as a case in point. To comply with the global discourse of women empowerment and development, the Government of Pakistan has taken many policy steps to empower women in the last seven decades. Despite of these efforts, the socio-economic and political status of women on the ground has not improved significantly as envisioned by the ‘stated policies’. This study investigated and explored the linkages between government policies and the process of women empowerment. This empirical study has been carried out by applying John Kingdon’s Multiple Stream Policy Process Theory and Naila Kabeer’s Empowerment Theory. The field research was carried out in Sindh province of Pakistan during 2015. Employing a qualitative methodology, the study has used both primary and secondary data sources. Primary data was based on the 14 key informants’ interviews with government and non-government policy actors. In

addition, four (4) focus group discussions (FGDs) were conducted with beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries of Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Program (BBSYDP). Whereas for secondary data provincial women empowerment policy and gender reform action plan document were reviewed. This study has bridged the existing research gap on women empowerment and the role of policy process in social work in Pakistan. The findings of this study revealed that BBSYDP has slightly improved 'women empowerment' indicators as policy windows have opened and created opportunities for women empowerment. But on the contrary, it was also identified that there are several other contextual factors that are needed to take into the account while designing and formulating policies for 'women empowerment' such as women education, patriarchal control and mobility. The study argues that social empowerment is utmost crucial for women empowerment. Study recommends BBSYDP should be strengthened and replicated in other provinces of Pakistan.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.0 Overview

This chapter gives general overview of the study topic, information about the historical background of the women empowerment policy and pro women legislation in Pakistan; importantly problem statement, research questions and objectives of the study. The scope and significance of the study in social work are also included in this chapter.

1.1 Background of the Study

It has been a long time to listen the words women empowerment, its policy and women rights in day to day life of Pakistan. Simultaneously, lower education, fewer work opportunities, violence against women, acid attacks, honor killing and poor health status are notorious issues of Pakistan which are often raised by national and international organizations (United Nations Development Programme, 2016). The thirst for researching empowerment comes from the curiosity that is raised by studying social work as empowering profession. The rationale for carrying out this research indicates researcher's own curiosity being grown as a woman in Pakistan. Her experiences induce her to research how opportunities are formed for women empowerment in Pakistan and what helps and impedes women to avail these opportunities.

Before starting in detail about the study, it is important to be familiar with the history of term empowerment. Empowerment traces its history from seventeenth century as the process to permit or enable (see literature review for detail). In the development discourse women

empowerment entered in the domains of social, political and economic rights movement. Academia discusses women empowerment in five main categories; political, economic, educational, social and psychological, based on their attributes. A study on political empowerment by Naz, Ibrahim & Ahmed, 2012, defines political empowerment as autonomy to vote, contesting elections, political expression and demonstration, authority and decision making for actions. Whereas various studies on empowerment discuss economic empowerment as wage employment, share of control over resources and security of work. Educational empowerment as social political and intellectual consciousness, understanding of the rights and demands for the fulfillment of the rights. Similarly, strengthened social relations, position in social structure and addressing any discrimination based on disability race ethnicity, religion or gender and life with dignity and autonomy are discussed as social empowerment. According to (Christens, 2012) psychological empowerment is having control over own lives, participation in decision making and development of critical awareness of socio political environment.

Pakistan is geographically divided in five provinces Sindh, Punjab, Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, Baluchistan, Gilgit Baltistan and federally administrative tribal areas. Pakistan is the sixth most populous country of the world with population over 207,774,520. Whereas 63.6 percentage of the total population lives in rural areas. Women constitute 48.7 percent of the total population of Pakistan (GoP,2017). In Pakistani society, it is generally believed that instead of parliament or any other working places, the primary sphere of women is home because men are considered

as the breadwinner for family. However, noteworthy representation of women in legislative bodies are due to quota system not being elected (Awan,2016). In 2001 the National Poverty Line established for Pakistan was 1.90 USD per person per day, whereas now World Bank has raised it to 3.50 USD that has raised the number of people living below the poverty line (Zaidi, 2018). Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI) identifies multiple overlapping deprivations suffered by households in 3 dimensions: education, health and living standards. MPA status indicates income poverty only tells part of the story. Whereas, the multidimensional poverty headcount is 39.5 percentage points higher than income poverty (UNDP, 2016).

Like all the developed countries, a debate on contemporary development for women empowerment was brought forward in the decade of 1990s around the developing world. During this decade, the Beijing Platform for Action (BPFA) 1995 regarded as a momentous for women empowerment. BPFA tied various nations of the world to bridge the gap for fulfilling twelve critical developmental areas identified by this platform to empower women. Several measures were carried out by the joining nations in follow up of this platform for meeting the goals to improve critical developmental areas of women empowerment (UN-Women, 2015).

With all joining countries, Pakistan also became the signatory of the BPFA declaration aiming at improving the livelihood of women and giving them equal opportunity and status (Moser & Moser, 2005). At this platform, former prime minister of Pakistan Benazir Bhutto described empowerment as not only a right to political freedom but also as a right to be independent, educated, having choices in life to select a productive

career, having possession of property and participate in business activities to flourish in marketplace (Bhutto, 1995).

Pakistan developed its first national plan of action (NPA) for women in response of international commitments and conventions. National Commission on Status of Women (NCSW), National Policy for the Development and Empowerment of Women (NPDEW), Federal Ministry of Women Development (MoWD) (devolved under 18th constitutional amendment) and Provincial Women Development Department (WDD) were established in the following years. Several legislations including honor killing, protection of women, harassment bill, amendment on *Hudood* ordinance, two laws on criminalizing the offense of sexual harassment, three laws on customary practices, acid attacks and women in distress, child marriage restraint act and Hindu marriage act were brought forward for women empowerment (Government of Pakistan, 2009; Mirza, 2011).

The aim of this research emerges from such context to understand the women empowerment policy contestation by policy actors utilizing the John Kingdon's multiple stream theory of policy process and Naila Kabeer's empowerment theory. Considering the limited time and resources, this research particularly focuses on Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Programme (BBSYDP) (now known as Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Human Resource Research and Development Board BBSHRRDB) implemented by Women Development Department (WDD) of Sindh province. BBSYDP was initiated in 2008-2009 to develop human resource in Sindh by providing employable skills to youth aged (18-35) in

89 trades. It is being implemented in partnership with various government and non-government institutes. As the current study tries to capture the policy contestation for women empowerment in Sindh, therefore this study focuses on the program implemented by WDD.

A lot of research has been done on multiple indicators of women empowerment by academia, development organizations and other institutions in Pakistan. The innovative aspect of this academic research is to focus on the role of public policy process for women empowerment with lens of social work. Research uses both primary and secondary data for this study utilizing qualitative methodology. For secondary data, desk review of the selected policy and programs is carried out. Primary data is collected through in-depth interviews of policy stakeholders and Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with beneficiaries of WDD skill development project and those who were not chosen as beneficiaries.

1.2 Problem Statement

The Government of Pakistan although has taken many policy steps for empowering women in last seven decades, still the status of women on the ground has not improved significantly as per vision of the policies. This research aims to investigate the link between government policies and the process of women empowerment.

According to Pakistan's millennium development goals report (GoP, 2013b, 2015), women population constitutes 48.8 percent of the total population of Pakistan. But from the women empowerment indicators particularly related to education, politics, health and poverty

reduction and their implementation in Pakistan, it is unlikely to achieve its goals by 2015.

Politics play crucial role in Pakistan. To enhance political participation of women, Pakistan became party for one of its first international commitment on the political rights of women in 1953 (Weiss, 2012). Pakistan introduced 33 percent quota for women in legislative councils at union council, tehsil, municipality and district level in 2000 after adopting devolution plan. While through an act in 2002, 17 percent seats were reserved for women in provincial and national assemblies and in senate which were three times higher than the previous 20 seats (Ali & Akhtar, 2012). However, due to the various legal, political, cultural and organizational factors and lack of women supportive policies, women participation remained low as twenty percent in governance process with two ministers in 2013-2018 legislative assembly (Jabeen & Jadoon, 2009; Awan,2016).

Pakistan has taken many steps to improve the economic conditions of women. But studies suggest there is a systematic lack of women supportive legislation for the access to resources and retaining property assets and credit (GoP, 2005; Khan & Maan, 2008). However, the First Women Bank Limited (FWBL) was set up in 1989 to meet the banking needs of women entrepreneurs and strengthen their access to credit in Pakistan (GoP, 2013a). But the requirement for collateral from bank makes the process of credit difficult for women entrepreneurs to formulate and develop a viable business plan. (Roomi & Parrot, 2008). National assembly's standing committee on women development (2009)

highly recommended that the First Women's Bank reviews the operation for easy access to micro credit and prepare a 5-year plan because Pakistan has 56.2 percent women who are microfinance borrower (Haq & Khalid, 2011).

In 2008, Benazir Income Support Program (BISP) was initiated by federal government aiming at covering 3.5 million poor families. The objectives of BISP were to compensate poor families to enhance their purchasing power by giving a cash grant of rupees 1000 and empowering women through targeting the female head of a family or adult female member of the family as a recipient. The cash is transferred to women unconditionally meaning that the women have no restriction from the side of the program about its utilization. She is free in making choices and decisions for its utilization in the family according to her own priorities (Arshad, 2011).

Vocational and technical education has been considered pivotal in improving socio-economic conditions by eradicating poverty through creating jobs (TVET Reform Support Programme, 2012). Government of Pakistan has initiated many programs at national and provincial level under Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA). There are some other institutes and projects which are initiated for providing market-based training and creating trained human resource. It is believed that these skills will help in wage employment. Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Program (BBSYDP) is one of the most prominent programs at Sindh province was initiated in 2008-2009 to boost economy by creating skilled human resource. The program is being

implemented in the partnerships with various public and private institutes as a mega program to eradicate poverty from Sindh province through several short and long-term trainings (BBSHRRDB, 2013; Siddiqi & Shaikh, 2010). On the contrary, share of women in the labor market is only 23% (13.8 million) which is not proportioned to the total population i.e. about 49 percent (13.8 million) (GoP, 2013a). However, the recent government report indicates slight increase in unemployed female ratio (GoP, 2017).

Women's education not only increases the ability of women to secure employment in the formal sector but it can also play a vital role to promote gender equality (Noreen & Khalid, 2012). History of female education in Pakistan remained lowest in the world up to 1990s. Realizing the situation 1998-2010, policy stressed on women education while during the tenure of General Musharraf in 2000, some major reforms were brought for education (Tariq & Bussry, 2012). Special emphasis was placed on education of girls and women under the commitment of Education for All (EFA) and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Some of the key features were to integrate non-formal education, new school buildings and upgrading of girl's schools from primary to higher in far flung areas, providing incentives, free text books, scholarships and free meal and nutrition for girls under *Tawana* Pakistan Program (NCSW, 2005). Regardless of all these initiatives, the report of EFA 2012 states two third of Pakistan's adult illiterate are women. This is the third largest population globally (EFA, 2012).

Lady Health Workers (LHW) program was launched in 1994 in response to “Health for All” commitment of Alma Ata Declaration 1978, aiming to provide family planning and prime health care services at community level. One LHW serves population of 1000 which means 100 households. Almost 100.000 women serve as LHW across Pakistan; besides providing health service, LHW program is a major employer of women (Khan, 2008).

Literature gives a detailed account of several legislative and institutional arrangements which socially aim to empower women in Pakistan. Working women hostels, crises cells, trauma centers; legislation to secure women from honor killing and domestic violence are some of the main initiatives taken by the government. While the ranking of indicators of women empowerment are still below compare to other neighboring countries (Jahan, 2016). Pakistan’s per capita GDP is better than HDI, which clearly indicates that economic stability does not guarantee human development. It is observed violence and fear of violence are powerful threat to women for restricting their participation on equal basis (Mumtaz, 2007).

Regardless of all the above-mentioned measures for empowering women, it is fact that Pakistan has not proved himself effective in dealing with inequalities pertaining to education, health, control over assets and resources, access to formal employment and decision-making capacity of women in comparison with their male counterparts (Arshad, 2011; Faisal, 2010). The quantitative increase in implementation of programs has not affected the lives of the women qualitatively (Ali & Akhtar, 2012).

Chaudry, Nosheen and Lodhi (2012) argue the steps taken for empowering women in the country lose their effectiveness due to their urban focused interest.

Finally, empowerment literally means to become powerful by improving status through education, economic opportunity and health (Dominic & Jothi, 2012).

Arshad (2011); Khan and Bibi (2011) argued that the lack of achievements in three basic dimensions of human development i.e. education, labor market and reproductive health require attention of researchers, policy makers and program implementers. It is observed that in academic literature of social work in Pakistan, there are no serious efforts have been made to investigate the government policy process for women empowerment in scope of social justice. Therefore, this study is designed to fulfill this gap in the literature. The study investigates how the policy process for women empowerment can be effective to meet anticipated policy outcomes and how empowerment is being perceived by the major stakeholders.

1.3 Research Question

Based on the problem statement, research rose following questions and aimed to answer these questions through comprehensive understanding of conceptualization of women empowerment and women empowerment policy process in Pakistan.

1. How women empowerment is conceptualized by policy actors in Sindh?

2. What are the accomplishments of BBSYDP to meet policy goals set for women empowerment by WDD?

1.4 Research Objectives

Research sets following objectives to meet the thrust of research questions.

1. To assess the challenges of policy process for women empowerment in Pakistan.
2. To investigate the link between policy process and women empowerment programs in Sindh.
3. To propose a facilitating policy process that can enhance women empowerment.

1.5 Scope of the Study

This study is carried out in the context of Sindh province of Pakistan therefore generalization of findings cannot be made for whole Pakistan. However, it provides understanding policy process for women empowerment at broader. Study serves two main purposes; first, to understand policy process particularly (agenda setting and implementation) to empower women using MS theory and the second is to know how policies effect the ultimate recipients (women) using empowerment theory. Therefore, the focus of data collection to understand policy process was key informant interviews with the policy actors engaged in policy process for women empowerment at federal National Commission on Status of Women (NCSW), provincial Women Development Department (WDD), and Women Parliamentarian Caucus (WPC) and at local level district office of Women Development

Department/ NGOs and activist). While for understanding the effectiveness of women empowerment policies, study focuses on the recipients of BBSYDP program implemented by WDD. The training under WDD is only given to the women. The FGDs data is primarily collected from one region of Hyderabad.

The BBSYDP program is being implemented by some other departments as well who offer different trainings in their departments. The only reason to not include trainees of other departments as informant is to focus the efforts of institute established for women i.e. Women Development Department.

1.6 Significance of the Research Study to Social Work

The global definition of social work states:

“The social work profession promotes social change, problem-solving in human relationships and the empowerment and liberation of people to enhance well-being. Utilizing theories of human behavior and social systems, social work intervenes at the points where people interact with their environments. Principles of human rights and social justice are fundamental to social work” (Isadora, 2004, p. 409).

This definition supports the context of this research because this study has emerged in the context where despite of various women empowerment legislations and policies having the well-being of women are questioned. Numerous problems regarding social, educational, economic and political rights exist within different spheres of social structure. These problems require attention to eradicate prevailing structural barriers.

According to Estes (2009), empowerment is one of the major focused areas of social work practice and social justice as primary goal (Idit, John, & Joseph, 2006). Hence the implementation of social justice goal requires a commitment to policy practice (McDonough, 1993). To be able to promote social justice effectively, social workers must understand the impact of social structure and policy upon service users and must be actively involved in policy practice (Gal & Peled, 2009; Iatridis, 1995). Looking at this study, it can be said this study begins from its thrust of literature in social work on policy process to empower women. It aims to produce new knowledge in the field of policy and empowerment that how these two concepts shape the well-being of women. It is observed, while more than 50 years of social work education in Pakistan, the focus of research remained on some general social problems. It is expected this research will help in opening new windows of social work research by contributing in literature on public sector policy process to empower women.

One of the notable features of this study is its multi-disciplinary applicability that may be relevant to gender studies, political science, public policy and administration, economics and sociology.

This study will guide the government and non-government policy advocates for women empowerment. It is also hoped findings of this study may also guide the BBSYDP and WDD for considering the issues of policy design and implementation highlighted in this study. The general understanding of laymen is seemed missing regarding policy stakeholders, their existence, role and relevance. Hence, this study will

facilitate the people to develop broader understanding of the institutes and stakeholders related to women empowerment.

It will also highlight and help in to gauge whether the current policy process is bringing desired outcomes for women empowerment. The study will also illustrate what proved windows of opportunity and what were the challenges of policy process. It is expected this study will contribute in future research as reference for policy process for women empowerment. It will also guide for future policy making to address numerous challenges of women empowerment policy. The process of Women empowerment policy lacks the important voices of those women for whom they are being formulated. This study has an important significance to bring forward those unheard voices how they perceive role of policies to empower them and whether the policy has attained their anticipated goals.

The study will also contribute by extending the women empowerment policy process analysis through Multiple Stream (MS) theory and Resources Agency and Achievements (RAA). It may also help in determining its applicability and possibly usefulness.

The study makes an important contribution to the international field by understanding how international policies influence national and domestic policy arenas. Therefore, this study will make a significant contribution to the literature on the formulation of women empowerment policies. Subsequently, this is the first study in Pakistan looking at women empowerment policy utilizing the John Kingdon's policy process theory in social work perspective. It is expected the three policy streams

i.e. problem, politics and policy process will help in understanding and suggesting intervening option for social work education and practice. Study will also contribute towards a better means of understanding women empowerment policy process.

1.7 Organization of the Study

This study is organized in five chapters. First chapter contains an introduction and general information about the study topic, research questions and objectives, scope of the study and significance of the study in social work. The second chapter includes literature review focusing conceptualization of empowerment, women's struggle for the rights and some major advancement for policies and practices around the globe and Pakistan to empower women; policy and theoretical framework are also discussed in this chapter. Third chapter discusses methodology of the research, population of study, method of sampling along with the process of data collection and analysis. Fourth chapter presents findings of the study i.e. Key Informant Interviews (KII) and Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) regarding the process of formulating the policies to empower women and the challenges of policy process. It also reflects how women conceptualize empowerment and the policies designed to empower women focusing BBSYDP by Women Development Department (WDD) Sindh province. Chapter five carries discussion including implication, recommendation and conclusion of the study.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.0 Overview

This chapter describes the literature on history and advancement for women empowerment and its linkages to policy process. It highlights the efforts and initiatives by the national and international community around the world generally and particularly in Pakistan to empower women.

The literature review is divided into four sections. Starting with etymology of empowerment, the first section, defines history of struggle for advancement to empower women around the world which in turn shaped the empowerment of women in 20th century. It gives a brief account of how historical development for women empowerment in the West influenced the East.

Section two presents literature on the journey of women in the Indian subcontinent in 20th century till the partition in 1947 and later. Researcher has given an overview of women life in Indian history before and after independence because it has a link with Pakistan by sharing the same history. Yet, the journey of the two countries after independence led them towards more focused and different direction which has significant impact on the women.

Third section, deals with the existing literature on situation of women and the usage of indicators of empowerment in Pakistan; what has been achieved so far in Pakistan? In this section, the literature discusses

the description about efforts of different institutions and government policies for empowering women in Pakistan.

The last section deals with the theoretical framework of this study and uses latest literature published on policy processes. In addition, this chapter also highlights and discusses the literature on role of governments, national and international community and civil society to empower women.

2.1 Etymology of Empowerment

Power is the key word of the term empowerment. Empower is the combination of prefix ‘em’ means to make, with noun ‘power’ from the French and Latin means having the capacity and the means to direct one’s life towards desired social, political and economic goals or status; the combination of two ‘Em’ prefix with ‘Power’ makes it verbs ‘empower’ meaning to make or cause power. The verb “empower” from which noun is derived was first appeared in the English language some two hundred years before (Dominic & Jothi, 2012; Lincoln, Travers, Ackers, & Wilkinson, 2002). In development discourse, the word empowerment is widely used. According to Lausch (2011) the frequent use of the word empowerment has made its definition blurred with a fact that it is a complex term that lacks a universal definition, the fact has allowed for an endless number of interpretations with differences and similarities (FRIDE, 2006).

Scholars (FRIDE, 2006; Lincoln et al., 2002; Tripathi, 2011) states the concept of empowerment traces its history in the mid-17th century

with the legalistic meaning 'to invest with authority'. Thereafter, it began to be used with an infinitive in a more general way meaning "to enable or permit". The Oxford English Dictionary defines "empowerment" as "the action of empowering "the state of being empowered" and it was first used in this form in 1849, Hamon L'Estrange in his book 'The reign of King Charles' this first usage was synonymous with the idea of authorizing or licensing.

In academic literature, the word empowerment first came in the scene regarding civil rights. The first article "Towards black political empowerment can the system be transformed" in 1975 which sought political empowerment for its follower. This idea of empowerment is an offshoot of the discourse on human development and it came into prominence after 1980s. Empowerment linkages with feminist discourse went a long way in shaping the idea of women's empowerment (Lausch, 2011; Sharma & Asthana, n.d; Tripathi, 2011). Adams (2008) states in Social work empowerment is capacity as well as process that enable individuals and communities to not only take control of their circumstances and exercise power to achieve their goals but simultaneously help themselves and others to maximize the quality of their lives.

The above literature confirms that empowerment is a given capacity or power to those who lack it or denied before by creating an environment where they can enjoy their rights equally with others.

2.2 Historical Overview of Women Empowerment

“We study the past to learn how to think about the present, to understand how change happens, to see how history creates and restrain possibilities for people to intervene deliberately in it and change its course; we study history so that we can understand the history of which we are a part and the changes we may be able to bring to it” (DuBois, 1998, p. 68).

To date, whatever has been done to empower women around the globe has deep roots in the history of struggle for the rights of women. To understand the policy process for women empowerment (government flexibility to bring reforms and the actors/advocates behind bringing the policy solutions), it is important to understand from the historical perspective. For this reason, do get deeper insight in this study researcher has focused some of the literature on the history of the major advancement for women rights.

In his study Mehta (1987) states the history of women struggle for their right started centuries ago. The first contributors to women’s human rights history are those who first taught them to read and explore the world outside the home and immediate community. Three hundred years before Beijing platform of action, first feminist Sor Juana Ines de la Cruz (1560-1760) believed that a central right of women is education, learning and creating and pursuit of knowledge. In this study, he traces women’s history from the late medieval 15th century and claims in west women’s subordination have a long history. The women movement started from the

British and American in medieval ages. Before the industrial revolution women's power was held by church and women domain was around keeping happy her husband and children. In 1770, Baron D'Holbach, a French philosopher wrote the tyranny of man over woman. However, at those times campaigners for women rights were isolated except those who were from well off families. The efforts of women got prominence by the end of nineteenth century when the focus of women in America and Europe became the right of vote; during this period women got the rights of separation, property and employment. After world war one the women's movement got more support. A brief about some of the major contributions in the history for advancement of women are discussed further in below sections.

2.2.1 Fifteenth to Nineteenth (1500-1900) Century

2.2.1 (a) The City of Ladies 1429

Contemporary literature discusses Italian cum French writer Christine de Pizan as feminist but her late medieval or early renaissance time's work discusses her as historiographer. In 1429, Christine de Pizan wrote the book "The City of Ladies" on the universal history of women, which talks about the lack of women's access to education. In her book, she encourages women of all classes to look at their experiences and resist being limited and demeaned by man. She argued for women to be educated, to be able to work and live independently and participate in public life (Fraser, 1999; Lehmann, 1995).

2.2.1 (b) Declaration of Women's Rights 1791

Olympe de Gouges of France wrote a “Declaration of the Rights of Women’s and the Female Citizen” in 1791 in response to the 1789 “Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizens” which was designed to ensure equality of all the citizens in French society the paradox was that the rights of women were completely ignored. This document made women political conscious. In this historic document, she openly argued the men’s oppression against women. In this declaration, she argued for the equal rights of women in all spheres including politics, vote and employment opportunities in public sector. She strongly supported women’s right to public speech. From the two most challenging arguments first was against the French patriarchal system, about communicating to partner that she is pregnant with his child and men were thus forced to recognize their illegitimate children, women alone should not get economic and psychological burden for upbringing their illegitimate children. On her second argument she was considered as a mentally insane person when she talked about equal rights for unmarried mothers whose children deserve their father’s official recognition, name and share in wealth (Zelinka, 2012).

2.2.1 (c) Vindication of the Rights of Women 1792

In the year 1792, Mary Wollstonecraft in England wrote ‘Vindication of the Right of Women’ that is discovered as first internationally known philosophical treaty on women rights. It became the foundation source of ideas for the women suffrage movement in

nineteenth century. She believed that women's fear of their incapability has kept them away from contributing any productive work. She demanded equal educational rights for women to enhance their morality and integrity with full potential as human being. This contribution offered holistic philosophy on women rights and supported women's formal political incorporation (Botting, Wilkerson, & Kozlow, 2014; Hawley, 2007).

2.2.1 (d) Seneca Falls Convention 1848

Seneca Falls, New York (July 1848), was the first organized formal setting for the women rights. It was a platform to discuss injustices women were facing from centuries and it was proclaimed that "all women and men are created equal" it criticized the marriage laws, conditions of employment and property right. The demand for justice and right of citizenship for half of the population by motivated group of women and men was its huge significances. It motivated and inspired activists to hold future meetings, circulate petitions and write letters, essays and deliver lectures in public. For years declaration of convention served as basic text for women rights. Seneca falls convention acknowledges London's 1840s world anti-slavery convention as a catalyst for this convention, where women delegates participation was opposed (McMillen, 2008).

2.2.1 (e) Women Suffrage 1865

Suffrages movement started just after the civil war. There were two major grounds for the instigating movement, first women realized the oppression of capitalism and male supremacy over women and the second

the social conditions of women in nineteenth century particularly sexual division of the labor and women's total dependence on marriage. All this brought a most advance political thought by identifying and criticizing capitalism as the major source of women's oppression and political exclusion as the basic source of women's oppression (DuBois, 1998).

2.2.1 (f) The Subjugation of Women 1869

In 1869 a series of essays on progressive theory advocating equality for women in society appeared. It appeared as pamphlet on subjugation of women by British parliamentarian John Stuart Mill. In this draft, he exposed his commitment towards gender equality. He argues that social and legal conditions restrict the liberty of women he also challenges belief about women inequality as natural phenomena and discourages legal subordination of one sex, to other. He speaks of domestic slavery by arguing marriage are alike legal slavery, marriage should be based on the equality before the law and division of power in the home. He argues that allowing women to control their own destiny and the freedom to hold an equal position in society will benefit by improved condition for women in marital relationship so that they are no longer legally subject to the will of a cruel husband but are, instead, equal partners in the marriage (Schwendinger & Schwendinger, 1973; Smith, 2001).

2.2.2 Twentieth (20th) Century and Beyond

2.2.2 (a) Foundation of United Nations 1946

In the consequences of failure of league to prevent World War II, the nations of world decided to create a new organization to fulfill the role of league. Many organizations that were with league before joined this new organization and the United Nations formed eventually. In a meeting in 1946 league dissolved itself and all its service property and mandate was transferred to United Nations. The structure of this newly established organization was more effective than league. The allied forces of World War II (Britain, Soviet Union, France, United States and China) become the permanent member of its general council (Docalavich, 2007).

2.2.2 (b) United Nation Commission on the Status of Women 1946

The United Nations Commission on the Status of Women (CSW) was established by the United Nation's Economic and Social Council in 1946 as the principle global policy making body exclusively on gender equality and advancement of women. CSW aims to promote women's civil, social, educational, economic and political rights and prepare recommendation and reports on women status and problems which require immediate attention in the field of women rights (Ghali, 1996).

2.2.2 (c) Women's Year 1975

The first task of the CSW was to conduct a global survey on the status of women's rights; the survey revealed four main concerns: Political rights of women and the possibility to exercise them, legal rights